

Hollywood & Recreating History: Historical Accuracy

The film *Cromwell*

Background

There was a growing political rift between Parliament and Charles I that caused a constitutional crisis. It reached the point that Charles declared that 5 Members of Parliament (the key leaders) were guilty of treason. This movie scene shows Charles' going to Parliament to arrest those 5 MPs.

Source #1 Hollywood Movie

[*Cromwell*](#): A Hollywood Movie. Nominated for 2 Academy Awards and won for best custom in 1971. Scene excerpt called "the arrest of the Five Members".

How does this source depict the arrest of the 5 Members?	Who does this source identify as the 5 Members to be arrested?	What role does Oliver Cromwell play in the arrest of the 5 Members?
They say that they were under arrest of treason, and that they were suggested to leave immediately.	Pym, Hamden, Holles, Hesilnge, Cromwell	He is the one that speaks out and says that people who are actively participating in parliament cannot be arrested.

Source #2 Primary Sources

[Eyewitness Accounts Primary Source](#) **Source A:** Clarendon's History of the Rebellion and Civil Wars in England, 1646-1674. **Source B:** From the Journal of an MP, Sir Simonds D'Ewes

How does Clarendon describe the arrest?	How does D'Ewes describe the arrest?
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The king came in to find a few men, and to arrest them ● He claimed that all of these men were guilty of treason ● The king sat in the speaker's chair ● He look around for them ● He claims that "all the birds had flown" meaning that all those men had fled 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The king came in with armed men ● There were 400 men that he came in with ● He gladly sits on the speaker's chair, ignoring the uncomfortableness ● He asks for Mr. Pym, one of the people who are guilty under treason ● The speaker replies "I have no eyes to see, nor tongue to speak"
How do the two primary sources corroborate the movie scene?	
Accuracies	Inaccuracies
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The king sits on the chair ● He asks for the men ● He come in with guards ● The people obviously fled, and the king notes that by using his king example. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● He only came in with a hundred men ● He sees one of the men sitting there ● The man tells of how it would be illegal to arrest him now ● He claims that parliament had dissolved ● The people block the door

Source #3 Secondary Source

[BCW Project](#) -- arrest of the Five Members -- Secondary Source

How does this secondary source corroborate the movie scene?

Accuracies

- The king did take the speaker's chair
- He asked for the 5 men
- He noticed that the men did leave and were no longer present

Inaccuracies

- One of the names of the people to be arrested is incorrect
- The king does not shut down parliament when he leaves
- he didn't see one of the men were still there.
- The man that was to be arrested in the movie wasn't present, so therefore didn't make any speeches

Source #4 Secondary Source

Britain in Revolution, [excerpt on the arrest](#), by Austin Woolrych (top British historian) Secondary Source [definitive account]

What are Woolrych's interpretations of events? Are his explanations incorporated in the movie scene? How or how not?

The names were changed again, and everything was named after the movie except for the name of the city

Source #6 Painting

[Charles I attempts to arrest of the 5 members](#) by Charles West Cope (Painting) {click on this link its a cool way to view a painting}

Analyze the accuracy of his image

The is speaking to the main speaker of the house he did come in to ask for the 5 men

Explain the significance of that fact that he painted this picture in the mid-1900s

This shows how much the king wanted the 5 men arrested.

Source #7 Film Review

[Review of the Cromwell film](#) by UK historian, Timothy Chant

What are Chant's key critics of the film?	What does he say are the merits of the film?
There are numerous errors in the movie, as he points out many of them.	some characters were pictured correctly like Charles the first and Harris Cromwell

Reflection Questions	
Question	Response
<p>Why do Hollywood films often include historical inaccuracies?</p>	<p>this is to entertain the readers in order to make better sales. However the drawbacks of this might include bending the facts and feeding wrong info to the watcher.</p>
<p>Including historical inaccuracies is not problematic in terms of historical memory. True or false?</p>	<p>This is false, because historical inaccuracies may change our historical memory, and just because the historical memory is correct, doesn't mean it will remain that way forever.</p>

15 Minute Debate

The Motion: Films about historical events help make the humanity more educated about the past.

1. Take 10 minutes with your partner to formulate an argument & write an opening statement

Outline of your Argument	Opening Statement

The Historical Record

What are historical records?

Historical records, also called archival records, are records you keep permanently because of their long-term research use. The State Archives provides services for both government and non-government historical records programs. Historical records, regardless of who creates them, can exist on paper, parchment, magnetic tape, film, or a variety of other media.

-- From the New York State Achieve

The Issues surrounding the movie Selma

Movie Trailer for Selma	<u>Impressions</u> Wow, it seemed so violent. There are SO MANY VIOLATIONS OF THE CONSTITUTION AND BILL OF RIGHTS. I feels so bad for blacks.
CBS News Story From Face the Nation	<u>Historical Controversy</u> They say that they did it quite well but they didn't show the relationship between the president and MLK
Selma director Ava DuVernay answer critics	<u>Director's Thoughts</u> Some parts of the film were inaccurate however the film is portrayed in however way you imagine it.

Consult the Historical Record

[LBJ Library](#)

Go to the LBJ Library and examine the variety of evidence that you the historian would have to consult in order to properly assess this historical topic.

List all the possible sources that need to be consulted

Summary of your thoughts on this issue and the historical record

--	--